

Minutes of the Virtual Regional Project Board

- **Project Name:** Reducing UPOPs and Mercury Releases from the Health Sector in Africa
- **Project ID:** 00096344
- **Output IDs:** 00090700
- **Venue:** Virtual (through e-mail)
- **Date:** 4-11 December 2020

1. List of Participants

Project Board:

- **Executive:** Gerd Trogemann, UNDP Istanbul Regional Hub (IRH) Manager / Chairperson of the Project Board
- **Senior Suppliers:** Rosemary Kumwenda, Senior Policy Advisor, HIV, Health and Development Team, UNDP IRH
Etienne Gonin, Regional Technical Advisor, Nature, Climate, Energy/Chemicals, UNDP IRH
- **Senior Beneficiary:** Representatives from the Governments of the 4 participating countries (Ghana, Madagascar, Tanzania, Zambia):
 - Carl Osei, National Project Director, Ghana Health Services, Ministry of Health, Ghana
 - Hanitriniaina Randrianomenjanahary, National Project Director, Ministry of Environment, Madagascar (voting member for Madagascar)
 - Hantanirina Ravaosendrasoa, Deputy National Project Director, Ministry of Public Health, Madagascar
 - Honest Anicetus, National Project Director, Ministry of Health, Community Development, Gender, Elderly and Children, Tanzania
 - Cheleka Mulenga, National Project Director, Ministry of Health, Zambia

Others:

- **Quality Assurance:** Abusabeeb Elsadig, Regional Programme Coordination, RBM and QA Specialist, UNDP IRH
- **Responsible Parties:** Susan Wilburn, Sustainability Director, Health Care Without Harm
Ruth Stringer, International Science and Policy Coordinator, Health Care Without Harm
Margaret Montgomery, WASH Technical Officer, World Health Organization
Ute Pieper, Senior Expert, World Health Organization

- **UNDP Country Offices:** Joel Ayim Darkwah, Programme Officer, UNDP in Ghana
Verosoa Raharivelo, Programme Officer, UNDP in Madagascar
Emmanuel Nnko, Programme Analyst, UNDP in Tanzania
Winnie Musonda, Assistant Resident Representative, UNDP in Zambia
- **Regional Expert Team:** Jan Gerd Kühling, Chief Technical Expert, UNDP IRH (Consultant)
- **Project Coordinator(s) and Team Members:** From the regional component and 4 national components of the project
 - Abena Nakawa, National Project Coordinator, Ghana
 - Solofo Raberahano, National Project Expert, Madagascar
 - Deogratias Mkembela, National Project Coordinator, Tanzania
 - Mazuba Mudenda Mwambazi, National Project Associate, Zambia
 - Selimcan Azizoglu, Regional Project Coordinator, UNDP IRH
 - Zuhre Guven, Regional Project Associate, UNDP IRH

2. Agenda and discussion

Members of the Project Board of the Regional Component of GEF financed UNDP implemented project, “Reducing UPOPs and Mercury Releases from the Health Sector in Africa” (GEF/MedWaste Africa) was invited via e-mail by Selimcan Azizoglu, Regional Project Coordinator, on 4th December 2020, to the virtual Project Board (PB) for the regional component of GEF/MedWaste Africa project, which was the last Project Board in the view of expected project closure by 31 December 2020.

Following the project’s extension granted in April 2020, the project at regional level has successfully completed several overdue project activities, such as delivery/installations of HCWM systems, maintenance capacity building workshops and preparation of exit strategies, lessons learnt report and other technical knowledge documentations. Moreover, the project has provided substantial support to the project countries on HCW management specifically in relation to the COVID-19 pandemic and became a resource project for many partners, stakeholders and countries beyond the project.

Currently, the project is on track for its operational closure both on its programmatic and financial plans. The project very recently completed the independent Terminal Evaluation (TE) which was extended to cover project’s progress and lessons learned during the extension period. The TE report rated the project, by various criteria, as an overall average of Satisfactory (see Table 1). TE report has also provided important recommendations for the project, its national partners and UNDP. Please be reminded that TE report once acknowledged will be considered as the final report of the project.

Table 1. Summary of TE ratings

Evaluation Criteria	Evaluator’s Rating
Overall quality of monitoring and evaluation	Satisfactory (S)
Overall quality implementation / execution	Satisfactory (S)

Relevance	Relevant (R)
Effectiveness	Satisfactory (S)
Efficiency	Satisfactory (S)
Overall Project Objective	Moderately Satisfactory (MS)
Overall likelihood of sustainability	Moderately Likely (L)

During the online regional closure exchange workshop on 1-2 December 2020, all regional/national project stakeholders could extensively discuss details of TE findings, recommendations, project's implementation and development progress, lessons learnt, impacts and sustainability considerations. Therefore, the aim of this virtual PB was 1) to receive final remarks of PB members on the project, its progress, impacts and lessons learned; 2) more specifically, on benefits and challenges of the regional component of the project; 3) and finally, receive PB's guidance and endorsement for the operational closure of the regional component of the project.

To facilitate the PB's review and decision, the regional Project Management Unit (PMU) has prepared a package with key documents enclosed as follows:

- Annex 1. Agenda (timeline) of the virtual PB meeting
- Annex 2. Annual progress report (Nov19-Nov20) – please see progress report's annexes in the [online folder](#)
- Annex 3. Way forward - Items brought to the attention of the Project Board
- Annex 3.1. Terminal evaluation report (and presentation slides of TE report is also enclosed)
- Annex 3.2. QA report for closure stage
- Annex 3.3. Project's lessons learnt report

All the documents above were submitted to the Project Board on 4 December 2020 for review and approval until 11 December 2020. All Project Board members provided their approvals, without further comments, on below recommendations (Section 3) via email between 8-14 December 2020. Logs of approvals provided by Project Board Member is attached in the Annex 1 to this document.

3. Project Board recommendations and conclusions

Following considerations were approved by the Project Board with a consensus:

- *Terminal Evaluation report was acknowledged as the final report of the project.*
- *Management of responses to the TE recommendations specific to the regional component were approved.*
- *Regional component's progress report (Nov19-Nov20) along with financial report (confirming that all funds will be disbursed by 31 December 2020) and 2020 Quality Assurance report for closure stage were approved.*

- *Project's lessons learnt report was acknowledged.*
- *The operational closure of the regional component of the project by 31 December 2020 was endorsed by the Project Board.*

Prepared by: Zuhre Guven (Regional Project Associate) and Selimcan Azizoglu (Regional Project Coordinator), UNDP IRH

Signature:

Zuhre Guven *Selimcan Azizoglu*

Date: 16-Dec-2020

Cleared by: Abusabeeb Elsadig, Regional Programme Coordination, RBM and QA Specialist, UNDP IRH

Signature:

Abusabeeb Elsadig

Date: 16-Dec-2020

Approved by: Gerd Trogemann, UNDP IRH Manager

Signature:

Gerd Trogemann

Date: 16-Dec-2020

Annex 1. Approval/comments log provided by the Project Board members during virtual Project Board consultations (4-14 December 2020)

Senior Beneficiary: Representatives from the Governments of the 4 participating countries (Ghana, Madagascar, Tanzania, Zambia)

- **Zambia:** Cheleka Mulenga, National Project Director, Ministry of Health

E-mail on 11th December:

Greetings find below the response!

Apologies for the delayed response.

Draft recommendations for the considerations of Project Board	Approve (Yes/No)
Consideration of acknowledgement of the Terminal Evaluation report and approval of management of responses to the TE recommendations specific to the regional component	Yes
Consideration of approval of regional component's progress report (Nov19-Nov20) along with financial report (confirming that all funds will be disbursed by 31 December 2020) and 2020 Quality Assurance report for closure stage	Yes
Consideration of acknowledgement of lessons learnt report	Yes
Consideration of endorsement of the operational closure of the regional component of the project	Yes

Regards,
Cheleka Kaziya
Assistant Director- Environmental Health

- **Ghana:** Carl Osei, National Project Director, Ghana Health Services, Ministry of Health

E-mail on 11th December 2020 by Abena Nakawa, National Project Coordinator, on behalf of Mr. Osei, due to Mr. Osei's family emergency:

Dear Selimcan,

Trust you are well.

We received an unfortunate news of the passing of Dr. Osei's mum which has caused his absence from the office.

I shared this with him awaiting his response. Please see attached for your attention. Should there be any changes after his perusal, I will share that as well with you.

Many thanks.

Best,

Abena

Attachment:

Draft recommendations for the considerations of Project Board	Approve (Yes/No)
Consideration of acknowledgement of the Terminal Evaluation report and approval of management of responses to the TE recommendations specific to the regional component	Yes

Consideration of approval of regional component's progress report (Nov19-Nov20) along with financial report (confirming that all funds will be disbursed by 31 December 2020) and 2020 Quality Assurance report for closure stage	Yes
Consideration of acknowledgement of lessons learnt report	Yes
Consideration of endorsement of the operational closure of the regional component of the project	Yes

- **Madagascar:** Hanitriniaina Randrianomenjanahary, National Project Director, Ministry of Environment

E-mail on 9th December 2020:

Dear Selimcan,

I acknowledge receipt your mail dated on 2020-12-04 concerning the virtual project board consultations for the draft recommendations of the UPOPs project and thank you very much. Then, please find in attached file my view for the draft recommendations.

I wish you a good receipt.

Sincerely

Liliane RANDRIANOMENJANAHARY

National Director of the Project

Ministry of Environment and Sustainable Development Madagascar

Attachment:

Draft recommendations for the considerations of Projet Board	Approve (Yes/No)
Consideration of acknowledgement of the Terminal Evaluation report and approval of management of responses to the TE recommendations specific to the regional component	Yes
Consideration of approval of regional component's progress report (Nov19-Nov20) along with financial report (confirming that all funds will be disbursed by 31 December 2020) and 2020 Quality Assurance report for closure stage	Yes
Consideration of acknowledgement of lessons learnt report	Yes
Consideration of endorsement of the operational closure of the regional component of the project	Yes

- **Tanzania:** Honest Anicetus, National Project Director, Ministry of Health, Community Development, Gender, Elderly and Children

E-mail on 8th December 2020:

Dear Selim,

Kindly find attached table of recommendation for consideration of approval during the Final Project Board Meeting.

Thanks,

Honest

Attachment:

Draft recommendations for the considerations of Projet Board	Approve (Yes/No)
Consideration of acknowledgement of the Terminal Evaluation report and approval of management of responses to the TE recommendations specific to the regional component	YES

Consideration of approval of regional component's progress report (Nov19-Nov20) along with financial report (confirming that all funds will be disbursed by 31 December 2020) and 2020 Quality Assurance report for closure stage	YES
Consideration of acknowledgement of lessons learnt report	YES
Consideration of endorsement of the operational closure of the regional component of the project or (Consideration for extension of project operation)	YES

Senior Suppliers:

- **UNDP IRH:** Rosemary Kumwenda, Senior Policy Advisor, HIV, Health and Development Team

E-mail on 11th December 2020:

Dear Selimcan

PB minutes endorsed/ approved from me without further comments.

Rosemary

- **UNDP IRH:** Etienne Gonin, Regional Technical Advisor, Nature, Climate, Energy/Chemicals

E-mail on 11th December 2020:

The same for me. Thanks! -- Etienne

Draft recommendations for the considerations of Projet Board	Approve (Yes/No)
Consideration of acknowledgement of the Terminal Evaluation report and approval of management of responses to the TE recommendations specific to the regional component	Yes
Consideration of approval of regional component's progress report (Nov19-Nov20) along with financial report (confirming that all funds will be disbursed by 31 December 2020) and 2020 Quality Assurance report for closure stage	Yes
Consideration of acknowledgement of lessons learnt report	Yes
Consideration of endorsement of the operational closure of the regional component of the project	Yes